

Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

Heliyon



journal homepage: http://ees.elsevier.com

Review article

Small, but smelly: the importance of *Solobacterium moorei* in halitosis and other human infections

Ibrahim Barrak^a, Anette Stájer^a, Márió Gajdács^{b,c,*}, Edit Urbán^{d,e}

^a Department of Prosthodontics, Faculty of Dentistry, University of Szeged, Tiszta Lajos körút 62-64, 6720 Szeged, Hungary

^b Department of Pharmacodynamics and Biopharmacy, Faculty of Pharmacy, University of Szeged, 6720 Szeged, Eötvös utca 6, Hungary

^c Institute of Microbiology, Faculty of Medicine, Semmelweis University, 1089 Budapest, Nagyvárad tér 4, Hungary

^d Department of Medical Microbiology and Immunology, University of Pécs Medical School, 7624 Pécs, Szigeti út 12, Hungary

^e Institute of Translational Medicine, University of Pécs Medical School, 7624 Pécs, Szigeti út 12, Hungary

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords Microbiology Epidemiology Infectious disease Dentistry Clinical research Solobacterium moorei Halitosis Malodor Bacteremia Anaerobe MALDI-TOF MS

A B S T R A C T

Solobacterium moorei (S. moorei) has been described as Gram-positive, non spore forming, obligate anaerobic bacillus from human feces. The traditional culture and identification of these strains is very difficult (as the strains are often not cultivable or they grow only relatively slowly, in addition to producing only a very few positive biochemical reactions in commercially available identification kits); thus, reliable identification may only be carried out using methods, such as matrix-assisted laser desorption/ionization time-of-flight mass spectrometry and DNA sequencing. Regarding its pathogenic role, the relevance of *S. moorei* in halitosis (oral malodor) has a good standing, as it has been suggested by multiple studies, while the isolation of these bacteria from invasive infections is very rare; there are only a few reports available in the literature, regarding infections outside the oral cavity. Based on these reports, affected patients are predominantly characterized compromised immunity and are frequently associated with a dental focus of infection. The aim of our present review is to summarize the currently available knowledge on the pathogenic role of *S. moorei* in halitosis and other infections and to emphasize the relevance of this neglected anaerobic pathogen.

1. Introduction, halitosis as a clinical problem

Halitosis (foetor oris, foetor ex ore, colloquially: foul breath, oral malodour) is the medical term used to describe all of the unpleasant smells and odors from the expired air, mouth or from outside the oral cavity, without any information about the correct source [1]. Approximately 10-30% of the adults in US and in the European Union and 30-60% of adults in developing countries suffer from this type of oral malodor [2]. Halitosis may occur under physiological conditions, such as nocturnal hyposalivation, however, this may be amended by proper oral hygiene [3]. Other causes (especially for transient malodor) without any pathological conditions include smoking, mastication of different parts of vegetables and consumption of various spices (e.g., onion or garlic) and alcohol [4, 5, 6, 7]. Hyposalivation/xerostomia (due to Sjögren's syndrome, adverse events associated with anticholinergic drugs, centrally-acting psychoactive agents, chemotherapy and radiation therapy) is also a very common cause of halitosis [8, 9, 10]. Some patients may suffer from halitophobia, a condition during which the affected person constantly fears that the smell of their oral region is re-

garded as repulsive by other people [8]. When assessing the origins of halitosis, most cases are found to originate from the oral cavity (80-90%; intra-oral halitosis: IOH, including infections or abscesses in the oral cavity, deep carious lesions, periodontal diseases, pericoronitis), while remaining cases are corresponding to non-oral causes (extra-oral halitosis: EOH) [11]. Based on the classification of Aydin and Harvey-Woodworth, the revised classification of halitosis includes physiological (Type 0) and pathological Type 1-5 (1: oral, 2: airway, 3: gastro-esophageal, 4: blood-borne, 5: objective) halitosis [12]. Ingestion of some chemical compounds may also cause halitosis - if the metabolic end-products of these agents are stable in blood, or they are capable of increasing the pH locally - facilitating the growth of halitosis-causing bacteria in the oral cavity [13, 14, 15, 16, 17]. Gastro-esophageal reflux disease (GERD) is also an important cause of malodor, with a similar underlying mechanism (increasing the pH in the oral cavity) [18]. The presence and overgrowth of many microorganisms has been implicated in causing oral malodor; with the advent of novel microbiological and diagnostic technologies, novel microbial species have also been associated with halitosis [19]. Although the literature regarding the topic

* Corresponding author. E-mail address: mariopharma92@gmail.com (M. Gajdács)

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2020.e05371 Received 6 July 2020; Received in revised form 25 August 2020; Accepted 26 October 2020 Available online xxx 2405-8440/@ 2020. is scarce, one of the novel species suggested to contribute to halitosis is *Solobacterium moorei* (*S. moorei*) [20]. In the present review, we aimed to surmise the the currently available knowledge on this neglected anaerobic pathogen – regarding its role in halitosis, in addition to the relevance of these bacteria in other, invasive human infections – to increase its notoriety among clinicians, dentists and clinical microbiologists.

2. Microbiology of Solobacterium moorei

S. moorei has been described as Gram-positive, non-spore-forming, obligate anaerobic bacillus from human feces by Kageyama and Benno in 2000, currently being the only member of the Solobacterium genus [21]. The bacterium was considered first as a native member of the human intestinal microbiome, but later, their pathogenic role has been identified in halitosis [22]. At the time of their discovery, phylogenetic analysis disclosed that the isolated strains were members of the Clostridium subphylum of Gram-positive bacteria [21]. The name of this species was originally known as Bulleida extructa or B. moorei; the genus Bulleida is a member of the Erysipelotrichidae family, which shows pronounced differences from the other genera of non-spore-forming Gram-positive bacilli, e.g., Bifidobacterium, Cutibacterium and Lactobacillus [23]. According to the original investigation, the tested S. moorei strains showed a 93% sequence similarity only to B. extructa, in addition to other phenotypic differences, therefore, a brand new genus was created [24]. Based on 16S rRNA gene sequencing data, S. moorei only has around 86% sequence homogeneity to Erysipelothrix rhusiopathiae and 87% to Holdemania filiformis, other representative members of the Erysipelotrichidae family [25]. The first deposited type strain of Solobacterium moorei is JCM 10645T [6]. Phenotypically, these rods are 0.2 µm by 0.4-0.7 µm in size and they do not possess flagella [1]. The traditional culture and identification of these strains is very difficult, as the strains are often not cultivable or they grow only relatively slowly, in addition to producing only a very few positive biochemical reactions in commercially available identification kits [21, 26]. The traditional phenotypic biochemical tests (as shown in the literature) are not adequate for the identification of these bacteria, due to the phenomenon of wide variety of phenotypic presentation, i.e. the isolates are not able to produce an uniform amount of positive and negative reactions to be reliably identified by biochemical methods [21, 22, 26]. Most of the published clinical S. moorei isolates characterized ferment glucose, galactose, fructose, maltose and ribose and hydrolyse esculine [21, 22, 26, 27]. The main product from glucose fermentation is acetic acid, while the other non-spore-forming anaerobic bacteria (e.g., Bifidobacterium, Cutibacterium, Eubacterium and Lactobacillus) may produce propionic acid, lactic acid, acetic acid, butyric acid and formic acid [28]. Zheng et al. reported that by using Rapid ID 32A test (bioMérieux, Marcy-l'Étoile, France), the investigated S. moorei clinical strains were show to produce α - and β -galactosidase (which play important roles in halitosis), α -glucosidase, arginine dihydrolase, arginine arylamidase, leucine arylamidase, proline arylamidase, alkaline phosphatase enzymes [24]. In a similar experiment, nitrate reduction, esterase and valine arylamidase production was also shown by the type strain JCM 10645T by the API ZYM system (bioMérieux, Marcy-l'Étoile, France) [24]. After 48-72 h of strict anaerobic cultivation, S. moorei forms small, grey colonies with a 0.5-1 mm diameter, some strains were described as α -haemolytic on anaerobic blood agar [24], although the isolate published by Lau et al. was non-haemolytic [27]. S. moorei strains have the ability to adhere to the lipophilic surface molecules of the oral epithelial cells through adhesins of hydrophobic character [29]. In addition, they may produce biofilms in the oral cavity; this biofilm-formation may be the first key step in the ecological succession in the mouth, leading to the development of halitosis [30].

Due to these hindrances, i.e. obscurity of the pathogen, difficulties in the isolation and correct species-level identification of *S. moorei* strains (especially in mixed cultures), there is a considerable underestimation of the real clinical significance of these bacteria in clinical situations [31]. The amount of publications concerning *S. moorei* are still scarce, nevertheless, the reported cases involving *S. moorei* infections increased significantly in recent years [21, 24, 27, 32, 33, 34, 35, 36, 37]. Nowadays, there has been considerable development and technological advancements in the methods used by routine clinical microbiology laboratories. Molecular diagnostic methods, such as matrix-assisted laser desorption/ionization time-of-flight mass spectrometry (MALDI-TOF) and DNA sequencing methods are essential for finding and appropriately identifying these bacteria from human clinical specimens [21, 22, 24, 38, 39, 40]. A summarizing table on the relevance of various microbiological techniques in the identification and diagnosis of *S. moorei* is presented in Table 1.

3. Role of S. moorei halitosis

The presence of anaerobic bacteria in clinical specimens can easily be distinguished owing to their putrescent smell [41]. This smell is due to the anaerobic respiration of these bacteria and the production of indole, skatole, polyamines, volatile sulfur compounds (VSCs; such as hydrogen sulfide, dimethyl sulfide, methyl mercaptan and allyl methyl sulfide), organic acids (e.g. amines such as cadaverine and putrescin; acetic acid and propionic acid) and short-chain fatty acids (SCFAs; including isovaleric and isobutyric acid) [42, 43]. The dorsum of the tongue provides a suitable environment for the accumulation of bacteria associated with halitosis, as the oxygen levels in the deep crypts of the tongue tend to be very low [44]. Species of the genera Bacteroides, Centipeda, Eikenella, Fusobacterium, Porphyromonas, Prevotella, Tannerella and Treponema have been highlighted as potent producers of the main VSCs and related compounds implicated in halitosis [45]. In addition, most of the abovementioned bacteria has been described as important periodonto-pathogenic species [46]. Out of the VSCs, S. moorei is capable to converting cysteine into hydrogen sulfide; in contrast -based on the results of Tanabe et al. and de Lima et al. - these bacteria are unable to produce methyl mercaptan from methionine or to produce other VSCs from complex proteins [47, 48]. The enzyme responsible (and the gene encoding for this enzyme) has been identified as the cysteine desulfhydrase, catalyzing the breakdown of cysteine into hydrogen sulfide, ammonia and pyruvate [47]. In addition, they have noted that S. moorei can only produce VSCs from mucin in the presence of an exogenous protease (e.g., Arg-gingipain produced by P. gingivalis) [48]. Nevertheless, as the dorsal region of the tongue is a rich source of proteases, VSC-production may in fact be important for S. moorei in vivo [49]. This might explain why there were higher levels of S. moorei found in the tongue coatings and saliva of patients with halitosis [50]. Due to its β-galactosidase-activity, S. moorei can also produce VSCs from salivary glycoproteins; this is relevant, considering that increased β -galactosidase-activity in the saliva has been associated with oral malodor [51, 52].

There is evidence to suggest that even very low concentrations of VSCs may be toxic [53, 54]. The toxicity may be related to the mechanisms of action of the agents that comprise VSCs; e.g., hydrogen sulfide can split protein disulfide bonds to form persulfide groups, bind essential metal ions and may inhibits enzymes such as myeloperoxidase, catalase, carbonic anhydrase and Na⁺/K⁺ ATP-ase, thus potentiating the mutagenicity of hydrogen peroxide [53, 54]. Another source of VSCs for example methyl mercaptan, increases the permeability of intact oral mucosa and stimulates cytokine production, leading to inflammation; for example, VSCs may induce the secretion of IL-8, which will subsequently induce osteoclast differentiation and contribute to the development of periodontitis [55, 56, 57]. Increased VSCs levels even may play a potential role in the link between oral infection and systemic diseases, such as preterm low birth weight and cardiovascular

Table 1

Relevance of various microbiological techniques in the identification and diagnosis of S. moorei.

| Method | Description | Characteristics | Producer | Advantage | Disadvantage |
|---|--|--|---|---|--|
| Conventional methods | Gram stain, wet mount characteristics, and susceptibility to metronidazole, vancomycin, kanamycin, colistin, and bile | Obligately anaerobic, Gram-positive, non- motile, nonsporing rod, Cell size: 0.2 μm x 0.4–0.7 μm | - | Essential as a basic test | The strains grow slowly and phenotypic variations appear to be commonly exhibited by different strains. |
| Gas-liquid chromatography (GLC) | Differentiation is based on fermentation products from glucose | Moderate amounts of acetic, lactic, and butyric acids and some strains also produced a small amount of pyruvic acid from PYFG broth. | - | None, outdated method. | |
| Fermentation of carbohydrates and enzyme tests | | Acid production from ribose, glucose, galactose, fructose, and maltose No acid production from arabinose, xylose, rhamnose, mannose, sucrose, cellobiose, lactose, trehalose, raffinose, melezitose, starch, glycogen, mannitol, sorbitol, inositol, erythritol, esculin, salicin, or amygdalin. Hydrolysis of starch: negative. esculin positive. Negative for: gas formation, indole production, nitrate reduction, gelatin liquefaction. | Diagnostic tablets/ disks Statens Serum Institut Diagnostica, Copenhagen, Denmark, Rosco Diagnostica, Taastrup, Denmark | None. | S. moorei strains produce relatively few positive biochemical reactions. The phenotypic identification of the isolates were not able to produce uniform amount of positive and negative reactions, the isolates also differed from the ones previously described. |
| Commercially available tests | Fermentation of carbohydrates and enzyme tests | nqueraciton. | Vitek 2 ANC, BBL Crystal Anaerobe, RapID ANA II, API ID32A | None. | S. moorei cannot be identified using any commercially available identification kits and report results as "no identification" There are differences in results between different commercial kits may be due to different amounts of the substrate or different reagents for detection. |
| MALDI-TOF MS | Ribosomal protein analysis | | Vitek (bioMérieux) or Bruker Matrix- Assisted Laser Desorption/Ionization Time-of Flight (MALDI-TOF) | Suitable, fast, cheap, but requires expensive instruments and software. Requires continuous software | The strains grow slowly and the organism cannot be identified reliably by MALDI- TOF. The organism's spectrum is unavailable in the older databases. |
| 16S rRNA gene sequencing | | | | updates. DNA sequencing is necessary in the process of identifying this bacterium from clinical samples. | Only this method is considered truly reliable. |

diseases [58]. Ierardi et al. reported a possible relationship between halitosis and *Helicobacter pylori* carriage in the stomach [15].

Years after its discovery, infections caused by *S. moorei* have been seldom reported, and in these cases, the bacteria were mainly implicated in different types of oral diseases: periodontal diseases, periimplantitis [33], dentoalveolar abscesses [36], subgingival plaques from patients with refractory periodontitis [59], localized aggressive periodontitis [60], halitosis [22, 64, 65], endodontic infections [14, 63], peri-radicular lesions [35], infected root canals [34]. As of now, there is insufficient evidence to suggest a role to *S. moorei* in the development of dental caries [20]. Schirrmeister et al. [35] found that *S. moorei* and *F. nucleatum* were the most common isolates in their study of n = 10 periradicular infections; these organisms were each found in six of the patients, and they were found in the same infections in five of these cases. Some of these abovementioned studies showed that *S. moorei* mostly resides in the oral region of patients experiencing halitosis, whereas the detection frequency in healthy volunteers was

much lower. S. moorei adheres to oral epithelial cells through the use of their adhesins and the subsequent formation of bacterial biofilm is thought to be a key step in the development of halitosis [4]. In their study Haraszthy et al. investigated the role of "non-culturable" bacteria in halitosis: they have used direct amplification of 16S rDNA, together with traditional microbial culture methods to identify the oral microbiome in the patients enrolled in the study. They found a greater bacterial species-diversity in samples taken from the dorsal surface of the tongue of subjects with halitosis: 32 species (13 "uncultured" or "unidentified" species) in the halitosis group, while 17 species only in the control group; S. moorei was considered a key, or "signal" bacterial species among the species demonstrative of the halitosis group. In this study, S. moorei was found in all halitosis subjects (100%), however, it was not detected by either culture or direct amplification of bacterial nucleid acid in the control subjects [61]. It is interesting to note that in their study, only 14% of tested individuals without oral malodor were positive for S. moorei, but all of these patients were experiencing periodontitis [61]. In a previous study in 2003, Kazor et al. associated the presence of halitosis with S. moorei, identifying it in only 1 out of 5 subjects without halitosis and in 3 out of 6 subjects with halitosis [62]. According to Gonzales et al. who carried out a EuroPerio9 study in 2019, S. moorei has the ability to generate VSCs in monospecies biofilms, although at lower concentrations than F. nucleatum or P. gingivalis [64]. The participation of S. moorei in a biofilm fosters the presence of pigmented Prevotella and Porphyromonas species in the biofilm. This could be explained by the β -galactosidase activity of *S. moorei*, which would provide greater access to nutrients for proteolytic bacteria, such as P. gingivalis or P. intermedia [24, 65]. Thus, S. moorei would facilitate integration of VSC-producing bacteria in the biofilm, but on the other hand, it is necessary to study the odor power of the VSCs that appeared in biofilms with S. moorei to establish how closely associated they are to bad breath [66]. In a study by Bernardi et al., culture-dependent and independent methods were carried out to characterize the composition of the tongue biofilm of halitosis patients: in their report; their study also highlighted the role of S. moorei (together with F. periodontium, P. melaninogenica and T. forsythia) in halitosis [67].

4. Role of S. moorei in human infections, other than halitosis

Although S. moorei was mostly isolated from human feces and was described as a member of the oral microbiota, this microorganism should also be considered as an opportunistic pathogen, responsible for severe infections. In addition to oral diseases, S. moorei has been reported to cause various infections, although the reports concerning extra-oral infections are relatively rare [68]. Based on the currently published reports, cases of infections caused by S. moorei mainly include bloodstream and surgical wound infections. These infections were associated with different types of cancers, an immunosuppressed state and some other predisposing factors, such are intravenous drug abuse, thrombosis and other bacterial and viral infections [20]. There are only eight different reports on bloodstream infection caused by S. moorei in the literature (presented on a patient-by-patient basis in Table 2.). Interestingly, in many affected patients, the source of the infection was presumed to be an abscess in the oral region. It has been suggested that the VSC-production of halitosis-causing bacteria (high concentrations of VSCs lead to increased permeability of the oral mucosa) The first case of bloodstream infection was described by Detry et al. in 2006 from a University Hospital in Belgium: the patient was a 67-year-old male with multiple myeloma, when the source of infection was presumably related to multiple dento-alveolar abscesses [69]. In a study concerning anaerobic blood culture positivity between 2013 and 2017 (which coincided with the introduction of MALDI-TOF MS in the routine diagnostic workflow of the laboratory) in a Southern Hungarian tertiary-care hospital by Gajdács et al., out of the n = 423 strict anaerobic isolates, four novel species were first reported in this geographical region [74]. All of the abovementioned novel species were among non-spore forming Gram-positive anaerobes and in one case of a 58-year-old male patient, S. moorei was the isolated pathogen. The improvements in the identification of these non-spore forming Gram-positive bacteria may be attributable to the developments in the MALDI databases, containing bacterial spectra [75]. In another report from Hungary, Sárvári et al. described five additional cases from the same region: all patients presented with underlying diseases (malignancy in 4 out of the 5 cases), and in most cases, S. moorei was isolated in mixed culture with other anaerobes of facultative anaerobes [31].

Zheng et al. described nine cases (out of 400) of surgical wound infections, when the complex aerobic-anaerobic bacterial culture involving the numerically dominant *S. moorei* flora played a principal role in the development of the infections [24]. They found *S. moorei* and *F. nucleatum* together in n = 2 of their cases, while *S. moorei* was found with two other *Fusobacterium* species (namely *F. equinum* and *F. gonidi*-

aformans) in one other case. They have hypothesized that *S. moorei* and *Fusobacterium* strains may act synergistically (i.e. pathogenic synergy), and/or each may supply growth factors for one another in *in vivo* conditions [24, 76]. Although the underlying mechanisms are not yet fully understood, there are several examples for this kind of advantageous interaction, e.g., between *A. viscous* and *P. gingivalis* (enhancing eachothers' growth and colonization levels in the oral cavity [77, 78]) and between *F. nucleatum* and *T. forsythia* (acting synergistically in protein degradation [79, 80]). A possible mechanism for *in vivo* synergism between *S. moorei* and fusobacteria may be found in the initial steps of VSC-production, where *S. moorei* is responsible for the initial deglycosylation step, which is required for *F. nucleatum* subsequently degrade proteins more effectively [81, 82].

5. Therapy of S. moorei infections, concluding remarks

In regards to the treatment of halitosis, the first step is the identification of the extent and the origin of the malodor [83]. If the halitosis is not pathological, adequate oral hygiene (including mechanical removal of tongue biofilm with tongue scraping or with a toothbrush) and abstaining from the consumption of odorous compounds will resolve the complaints [84]. Oral care may be supplemented by the use of products containing cetylpyridinium chloride, chlorhexidine, chloride dioxide, zinc salts or natural (plant-based) compounds capable of inhibiting bacterial growth or neutralizing VSCs [85]. If halitosis is diagnosed to be pathological, the management of the complaints will largely depend on the origin (IOH or EOH), the organ systems affected and/or existing underlying diseases of the patient [11].

S. moorei infections should be treated with antibiotic-therapy, taking into account the anaerobic respiration of the pathogen [41]. Thus, only agents with anti-anaerobic activity should be considered (penicillin, piperacillin-tazobactam, clindamycin, metronidazole, meropenem, moxifloxacin, tigecycline and vancomycin), in addition to the characteristics of the patient (e.g., kidney function, hypersensitivity) and the clinical presentation of the infection [86]. Based on the abovementioned reports available, clinical S. moorei isolates exhibit uniform susceptibility to common antibiotics used for the treatment anaerobic infections. In dentistry, amoxicillin/clavulanic acid, metronidazole and clindamycin are most frequently used: the former for its good tolerability, metronidazole for its potent anti-anaerobic activity (except for some Gram-positive anaerobes, such as (Actinomyces spp., Bifidobacterium spp., Cutibacterium spp. and Lactobacillus spp.)), while the latter is characterized by good penetration into abscesses [87]. For dental infections and wound infections, surgical debridement and drainage of pus is commonly required to supplement therapy and to oxygenize the affected tissues.

Solobacterium moorei is a recently described Gram-positive, non-spore-forming, obligate anaerobic bacillus; this pathogen is less well-known to clinicians as other members of Gram-positive rods. In addition, the literature concerning these bacteria is extremely scarce, which was demonstrated in this review. Regarding its pathogenic role, the relevance of *S. moorei* in halitosis has a good standing, as it has been suggested by multiple studies, while the isolation of these bacteria from invasive infections is very rare; there were only a few reports of infections outside the oral cavity. Nevertheless, all of abovementioned articles point to the fact that *S. moorei* might be more prevalent in bacteremia than believed so far, and the usefulness of MALDI-TOF MS and 16S RNA gene sequencing for the discovery and identification of this non-spore-forming strictly anaerobic Gram-positive bacillus (if these technologies are available) cannot be emphasized enough times.

The clinical data available from the published reports indicate that the patients to whom have compromised immunity (e.g., hematological malignancies or solid tumors, diabetes, intravenous drug use and a significant medical history previous surgical intervention) are more prone to *S. moorei* bacteremia across all genders and age groups. Sepsis and/

Table 2

Published cases of S. moorei bacteremia presented in a patient-by-patient basis.

| Case number | Age/Sex | Infection | Underlying Diseases | Output | Treatment | Author/Country | Year |
|----------------|---------|--|--|-------------------------------|---|--------------------------------------|------|
| 1. | 67/M | Sepsis Dentoalveoral abscess | Multiple myeloma, autologous bone marrow graft | Improved and discharged | Cefepime No surgical | Detry et al., [69] Belgium | 2006 |
| 2. | 43/F | Acute proctitis | Carcinoma of the cervix stage III-B | Recovered | Piperacillin- tazobactam No surgical | Lau et al., [27] Hong-Kong | 2006 |
| 3. | 37/M | Septic pulmonary embolism femoral vein | Intravenous drug abuse | Recovered | penicillin and metronidazole No surgical | Martin et al. [70] UK | 2007 |
| 4. | 43/M | Fever, anemia, diarrhea, Tooth abscess | Lymphoma, kidney transplantation | Recovered | penicillin and metronidazole No surgical | Pedersen et al. [26] Denmark | 2011 |
| 5. | 66/F | Pulmonary abscess, Sepsis | Non-small-cell lung carcinoma with meningeal carcinomatosis | Not known | 1. cefuroxime + gentamicin 2: meropenem + metronidazole + ciprofloxacin 3.metronidazole No surgical | | |
| 6. | 64/M | Sepsis, fever | Complicated abdominal surgery, Colon cancer | Improved and discharged | Cefuroxime + metronidazole No surgical | | |
| 7. | 33/F | Femoral vein thrombosis and abscess, fever, headache | Intravenous drug abuse, Chronic HBV infection | Recovered | 1.Cefuroxime 2.Penicillin + metronidazole No surgical | | |
| 8. | 77/M | Pneumonia, fever, dry cough, toothache | Prostate cancer Previous chronic heart disease | Recovered | Penicillin No surgical | | |
| 9. | 56/M | General malaise | Fournier gangreana | Not known | Not known | Hernandez Blaco et al. [71] Spain | 2017 |
| 10. | 58/M | Sepsis | alcoholic polyneuropathy, encephalopathy, COPD, broken left femoral neck and neuromuscular dysfunction of the urinary bladder | Died | Did not accept any antibiotics, intensive or surgical therapy | Gajdács et al. [74] Hungary | 2017 |
| 11. | 61/M | Persistent coma, intermittent convulsions, halitosis, intermittent fever | TTC, hypertension, hyperlipidemia, type 2 diabetes, rectal cancer, brucellosis | Died | Vancomycin + meropenem No surgical | Liu et al. [72] China | 2019 |
| 12. | 70/M | Pneumonia | HSV-1 oesophagitis, HIV infection Diabetes | Not known | Amoxicillin/clavulanic acid | Genderini et al. [73] Belgium | 2019 |

M: male; F: female; TTC: thrombotic thrombocytopenic purpura; HBV: hepatitis B virus; HIV: human immunodeficiency virus; HSV-1: herpes simplex virus-1.

or bacteremia caused by *S. moorei* may originate from different oral infections, lung abscess, abdominal infections, and from the lesser-known habit of licking needles by intravenous drug users. During clinical assessment of patients with blood cultures positive for *S. moorei*, it is recommended to first search for dental focus of infection. Based on the currently available reports, a case of possible pathogenic synergy between *S. moorei* and *Fusobacterium* spp. has been suggested (as they have been commonly co-isolated), however, the exact mechanism is poorly understood. Overall, it can be concluded that our present knowl-

edge about *S. moorei* is scarce, and intense research associated to this anaerobe is warranted to further characterize its role in the pathogenesis of human infections, including halitosis and invasive processes.

Declarations

Author contribution statement

All authors listed have significantly contributed to the development and the writing of this article.

Funding statement

This work was supported by the University of Szeged Open AccessFund (Grant number: 4837). M.G. was supported by the János Bolyai Research Scholarship (BO/00144/20/5) of the Hungarian Academy of Sciences and the New National Excellence Programme (ÚNKP-20-5-SZTE-330) of the Ministry of Human Resources. Support from Ministry of Human Capacities, Hungary grant 20391-3/2018/ FEKUSTRAT is acknowledged. M.G. would also like to acknowledge the support of ESCMID's "30 under 30" Award.

Competing interest statement

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

Additional information

No additional information is available for this paper.

References

- J.R. Cortelli, M.D.S. Barbosa, M.A. Westphal, Halitosis: a review of associated factors and therapeutic approach, Braz. Oral Res. 22 (2008) 44–54.
- [2] L.H. Meskin, A breath of fresh air, J. Am. Dent. Assoc. 127 (1996) 1282–1286.
- [3] T. Murata, T. Yamaga, T. Iida, H. Miyazaki, K. Yaegaki, Classification and examination of halitosis, Int. Dent. J. 52 (2002) 181–186.
- [4] M. Faveri, M.F. Hayacibara, G.C. Pupio, J.A. Cury, C.O. Tsuzuki, R.M. Hayacibara, A cross-over study on the effect of various therapeutic approaches to morning breath odour, J. Clin. Periodontol. 33 (2006) 555–560.
- [5] P.P. Lee, W.Y. Mak, P. Newsome, The aetiology and treatment of oral halitosis: an update, Hong Kong Med. J. 10 (2004) 414–418.
- [6] M. Rosenberg, T. Knaan, D. Cohen, Association among bad breath, body mass index, and alcohol intake, J. Dent. Res. 86 (2007) 997–1000.
- [7] C. Scully, J. Greenman, Halitology (breath odour: aetiopathogenesis and management), Oral Dis. 18 (2012) 333–345.
- [8] E.L. Attia, K.G. Marshall, Halitosis, Can. Med. Assoc. J. 126 (1982) 128–135.
 [9] M.L.C. Bollen, T. Biekler, Halitosis: the multidisciplinary approach, Int. J. Oral Sci.
- 4 (2012) 55–63.
- [10] C. Koga, M. Yoneda, K. Nakayama, S. Yokoue, M. Haraga, T. Oie, A. Suga, F. Okada, H. Matsuura, F. Tsue, N. Suzuki, T. Hirofuji, The detection of Candida species in patients with halitosis, Int J Dent 2014 (2014) e857647.
- [11] K. Hampelska, M.M. Jaworska, Z.L. Babalska, T.M. Karpnski, The role of oral microbiota in intra-oral halitosis, J. Clin. Med. 9 (2020) e2484.
- [12] M. Aydin, C.N. Harvey-Woodworth, Halitosis: a new definition and classification, Br. Dent. J. (2014) e217.
- [13] T.M. Durham, T. Malloy, E.D. Hodges, Halitosis: knowing when 'bad breath' signals systemic disease, Geriatrics 48 (1993) 55–59.
- [14] S. Chen, L. Zieve, V. Mahadevan, Mercaptans and dimethylsulfide in the breath of patients with cirrhosis of the liver, J. Lab. Clin. Med. 7 (1970) 628–635.
- [15] W.A. Gahl, J. Infelfinger, P. Mohan, I. Bernardini, P.E. Hyman, A. Tangerman, Intravenous cysteamine therapy for nephropatic cystinosis, Pediatr. Res. 38 (1995) 579–584.
- [16] E. Ierardi, A. Amoruso, T. La Notte, R. Francavilla, S. Castellaneta, E. Marrazza, R.A. Monno, A. Francavilla, Halitosis and Helicobacter pylori, Dig. Dis. Sci. 43 (1998) 2733–2737.
- [17] M. Torsten, G. Gómez-Moreno, A. Aguilar-Salvatierra, Drug-related oral malodour (halitosis): a literature review, Eur. Rev. Med. Pharmacol. Sci. 21 (2017) 4930–4934.
- [18] F. Struch, C. Schwahn, H. Wallaschofski, H.J. Grabe, H. Wölzke, M.M. Lerch, P. Meisel, T. Kocher, Self-reported halitosis and gastro-esophageal reflux disease in the general population, J. Gen. Intern. Med. 23 (2008) 260–266.
- [19] K.V. Hiranmayi, K. Sirisha, M.V.R. Rao, P. Sudhakar, Novel pathogens in periodontal microbiology, J. Pharm. BioAllied Sci. 9 (2017) 155–163.
- [20] F. Vancauwengberghe, J. Dadamio, I. Laleman, M. Van Tornout, W. Teughels, W. Coucke, M. Quirynen, The role of *Solobacterium moorei* in oral malodour, J. Breath Res. (2013) 7 e046006.
- [21] A. Kageyama, Y. Benno, Phylogenetic and phenotypic characterization of some Eubacterium-like isolates from human feces: description of Solobacterium moorei gen. nov., sp. nov, Microbiol. Immunol. 44 (2000) 223–227.
- [22] V.I. Haraszthy, J.J. Zambon, P.K. Sreenivasan, M.M. Zambon, D. Gerber, R. Rego, C. Parker, Identification of oral bacterial species associated with halitosis, JADA 138 (2007) 1113–1120.
- [23] B. Kloesel, M. Beliveau, R. Patel, R.T. Trousdale, I.G. Sia, Bulleidia extructa periprosthetic hip joint infection, United States, Emerg. Infect. Dis. 19 (2013) 1170–1171.
- [24] G. Zheng, P.H. Summanen, D. Talan, R. Bennion, M.C. Rowlinson, S.M. Finegold, Phenotypic and molecular characterization of Solobacterium moorei isolates from patients with wound infection, J. Clin. Microbiol. 48 (2010) 873–876.
- [25] Y. Ogawa, T. Ooka, F. Shi, Y. Ogura, K. Nakayama, T. Hayashi, Y. Shimoji, The genome of Erysipelothrix rhusiopathiae, the causative agent of swine erysipelas,

reveals new insights into the evolution of firmicutes and the organism's intracellular adaptations, J. Bacteriol. 193 (2011) 2959–2971.

- [26] R.M. Pedersen, H.M. Holt, U.S. Justesen, Solobacterium moorei bacteremia: identification, antimicrobial susceptibility and clinical characteristics, J. Clin. Microbiol. 49 (2011) 2766–2768.
- [27] S.K.P. Lau, J.L.L. Teng, K.W. Leung, N.K.H. Li, K.H.L. Ng, K.Y. Chau, T.L. Que, P.C.Y. Woo, K.Y. Yuen, Bacteremia caused by Solobacterium moorei in a patient with acute proctitis and carcinoma of the cervix, J. Clin. Microbiol. 44 (2006) 3031–3034.
- [28] P. Markowiak-Kopec, K. Slizewkska, The effect of probiotics on the production of short-chain fatty acids by human intestinal microbiome, Nutrients 12 (2020) e1107.
- [29] N.B. Parahitiyawa, L.J. Jin, W.K. Leung, W.C. Yam, L.P. Samaranayake, Microbiology of odontogenic bacteriemia: beyond endocarditis, Clin. Microbiol. Rev. 22 (2009) 46–64.
- [30] L.J. Motta, J.C. Bachiega, C.C. Guedes, L.T. Laranja, S.K. Bussadori, Association between halitosis and mouth breathing in children, Clinics (São Paulo) 66 (2011) 939–942.
- [31] K.P. Sárvári, D. Sántha, R. Kovács, S. Körmöndi, Z. Pető, T. Vereb, B. Sztanó, Six cases of Solobacterium moorei isolated alone or in mixed culture in Hungary and comparison with previously published cases, Anaerobe 65 (2020) 102241.
- [32] M.D. Williams, C.A. Kerber, H.F. Tergin, Unusual presentation of Lemierre's syndrome due to Fusobacterium nucleatum, J. Clin. Microbiol. 41 (2003) 3445–3448.
- [33] T. Koyanagi, M. Sakamoto, Y. Takeuchi, M. Ohkuma, Y. Izumi, Analysis of microbiota associated with peri-implantitis using 16S rRNA gene clone library, J. Oral Microbiol. 2 (2010) e5104.
- [34] H.J.A. Rolph, A. Lennon, M.P. Riggio, W.P. Saunders, D. McKenzie, L. Coldero, J. Bragg, Molecular identification of microorganisms from endodontic infections, J. Clin. Microbiol. 39 (2001) 3282–3289.
- [35] J.F. Schirrmeister, A.L. Liebenow, K. Pelz, A. Wittmer, A. Serr, E. Hellwig, A. Al-Ahmad, New bacterial compositions in root-filled teeth with perradicular lesions, J. Endod. 35 (2009) 169–174.
- [36] J. Downes, M.A. Munson, D.A. Spratt, E. Kononen, E. Tarkka, H. Jousimies-Somer, W.G. Wade, Characterisation of Eubacterium-like strains isolated from oral infections, J. Med. Microbiol. 50 (2001) 947–951.
- [37] N. George, E. Flamiatos, K. Kawasaki, N. Kim, C. Carriere, B. Phan, R. Joseph, S. Strauss, R. Kohli, D. Choi, J.C. Baumgartner, C. Sedgely, T. Maier, C.A. Machida, Oral microbiota species in acute apical endodontic abscesses, J. Oral Microbiol. 8 (2016) e30989.
- [38] E. Nagy, S. Becker, M. Kostrzewa, N. Barta, E. Urbán, The value of MALDI-TOF MS for the identification of clinically relevant anaerobic bacteria in routine laboratories, J. Med. Microbiol. 61 (2012) 1393–1400.
- [39] M. Gajdács, E. Urbán, Relevance of anaerobic bacteria in adult patients: a never-ending story?, Eur. J. Microbiol. Immunol. (2020).
- [40] S. Shannon, D. Kronemann, R. Patel, A.N. Schuetz, Routine use of MALDI-TOF MS for anaerobic bacterial identification in clinical microbiology, Anaerobe 54 (2018) 191–196.
- [41] M. Gajdács, G. Spengler, E. Urbán, Identification and antimicrobial susceptibility testing of anaerobic bacteria: Rubik's cube of clinical microbiology?, Antibiotics 6 (2017) e25.
- [42] M.K. Nakhleh, M. Qatredeniers, H. Haick, Detection of halitosis in breath: between the past, present and future, Oral Dis. 24 (2017) 685–695.
- [43] D.A. Bicak, A current approach to halitosis and oral malodor- A mini review, Open Dent. J. 12 (2018) 322–330.
- [44] J.H. Kang, D.J. Kim, B.K. Choi, J.W. Park, Inhibition of malodorous gas formation by oral bacteria with cetylpyridinium and zinc chloride, Arch. Oral Biol. 84 (2017) 133–138.
- [45] P.D. Marsh, Role of the oral microflora in health, Microb. Ecol. Health Dis. 12 (2000) 130–137.
- [46] G.S. Madhushankari, A. Yamunadevi, M. Selvamani, M.K.P. Kumar, P.S. Basandi, Halitosis – an overview: Part-I – classification, etiology, and pathophysiology of halitosis, J. Pharm. BioAllied Sci. (2015) 7 S339-S343.
- [47] S. Tanabe, D. Greiner, Characterization of volatile sulfur compound production by Solobacterium moorei, Arch. Oral Biol. 57 (2012) 1639–1643.
- [48] P.O. de Lima, B.D. Nani, B. Almeida, F.K. Marcondes, F.C. Groppo, A.B.A. de Moraes, M. Franz-Montan, K. Cogo-Müller, Stress-related salivary proteins affect the production of volatile sulfur compounds by oral bacteria, Oral Dis. 24 (2018) 1358–1366.
- [49] N. Mugita, T. Nambu, K. Takahashi, P.L. Wang, Y. Komasa, Proteases, actinidin, papain and trypsin reduce oral biofilm on the tongue in elderly subjects and in vitro, Arch. Oral Biol. 82 (2017) 233–240.
- [50] V.I. Haraszthy, J.J. Zambon, P.K. Sreenivasan, M.M. Zambon, D. Gerber, R. Rego, C. Parker, Identification of oral bacterial species associated with halitosis, JADA 138 (2007) 1113–1120.
- [51] Y. Masuo, N. Suzuki, M. Yoneda, T. Naito, T. Hirofuji, Salivary b-galactosidase affects physiological oral malodour, Arch. Oral Biol. 57 (2012) 87–93.
- [52] M. Yoneda, Y. Masuo, N. Suzuki, T. Iwamoto, T. Hirofuji, Relationship between the b-galactosidase activity in saliva and parameters associated with oral malodour, J. Breath Res. 4 (2010) e017108.
- [53] K. Yaegaki, Oral malodorous compounds are periodontally pathogenic and carcinogenic, J. Dent. Sci. Res. 44 (2008) 100–108.
- [54] L. Milella, The negative effects of volatile sulphur compounds, J. Vet. Dent. 32 (2015) 99–102.
- [55] H. Ili, T. Imai, K. Yaegaki, T. Murata, T. Sato, T. Kamoda, Oral malodorous compound inhibits osteoblast proliferation, J. Periodontol. 80 (2009) 2028–2034.
- [56] H. Ili, T. Imai, K. Yaegaki, K. Irie, D. Ekuni, M. Morita, Oral malodorous compound induces osteoclast differentiation without receptor activator of nuclear factor kB ligand, J. Periodontol. 81 (2010) 1691–1697.

- [57] W. Chen, M. Kajiya, G. Giro, K. Ouhara, H.E. Mackler, H. Mawardi, H. Boisvert, M.J. Duncan, K. Sato, T. Kawai, Bacteria-derived hydrogen sulfide promotes IL-8 production from epithelial cells, Biochem. Biophys. Res. Commun. 391 (2010) 645–650.
- [58] E. Urbán, M. Radnai, T. Novák, I. Gorzó, A. Pál, E. Nagy, Distribution of anaerobic bacteria among pregnant periodontitis patients who experience preterm delivery, Anaerobe 12 (2006) 52–57.
- [59] A. Colombo, V. Paula, S. Boches, L. Sean, J. Goodson, R. Kent, A. Haffajee, S. Socransky, Comparison of subgingival microbial profiles of refractory periodontitis, severe periodontitis and periodontal health using the human oral microbe identification microarray, J. Periodontol. 80 (2009) 1421–1432.
- [60] L.M. Shaddox, H. Huang, T. Lin, W. Hou, P.L. Harrison, I. Aukhil, C.B. Walker, V. Klepac-Ceraj, B.J. Paster, Microbiological characterization in children with aggressive periodontitis, J. Dent. Res. 91 (2012) 927–933.
- [61] V.I. Haraszthy, D. Gerber, B. Clark, P. Moses, C. Parker, P.K. Sreenivasan, J.J. Zambon, Characterization and prevalence of Solobacterium moorei associated with oral halitosis, J. Breath Res. (2008) 2 e017002.
- [62] C.E. Kazor, P.M. Mitchell, A.M. Lee, L.N. Stokes, W.J. Loesche, F.E. Dewhirst, B.J. Paster, Diversity of bacterial populations on the tongue dorsa of patients with halitosis and healthy patients, J. Clin. Microbiol. 41 (2003) 558–563.
- [63] I.N. Rocas, M. Hulsmann, J.F. Siqueira Jr., Microorganisms in root canal-treated teeth from a German population, J. Endod. 34 (2008) 926–931.
- [64] M. Gonzáles, A. Soler, R. Gómez, V. Blanc, R. León, Influencia de Solobacterium moorei en la producción de compuestos volátiles orgánicos responsables de la halitosis, Presented at: Europerio 9 (Amsterdam 2018), 2019 Available online https://www.dentaid.es/pro/recursos/estudio-cientifico/influencia-solobacteriumhalitosis/71. (Accessed 19 May 2020).
- [65] G.M. Barbosa, A.V. Colombo, P.H. Rodrigues, M.R.L. Simionatto, Intraspecies variability affects heterotypic biofilms of Porphyromonas gingivalis and Prevotella intermedia: evidences of strain-dependence biofilm modulation by physical contact and by released soluble factors, PloS One (2015) 25 e0138687.
- [66] A. Tangerman, E.G. Winkel, Volatile sulfur compounds as the cause of bad breath: a review, Phosphorus, Sulfur Silicon Relat. Elem. (2013) 188.
- [67] S. Bernardi, L. Karygianni, A. Filippi, A.C. Anderson, A. Zürcher, E. Hellwig, K. Vach, G. Macchaiarelli, A. Al-Ahmad, Combining culture and culture-independent methods reveals new microbial composition of halitosis patients' tongue biofilm, MicrobiologyOpen 9 (2020) e958.
- [68] M.D. Williams, C.A. Kerber, H.F. Tergin, Unusual presentation of Lemierre's syndrome due to Fusobacterium nucleatum, J. Clin. Microbiol. 41 (2003) 3445–3448.
- [69] G. Detry, D. Pierard, K. Vandoorslaer, G. Wauters, V. Avesani, Y. Glupczynski, Septicemia due to Solobacterium moorei in a patient with multiple myeloma, Anaerobe 12 (2006) 160–162.
- [70] C.A. Martin, R.S. Wijesurendra, C.D.R. Borland, J.A. Karas, Femoral vein thrombophlebitis and septic pulmonary embolism due to a mixed anaerobic infection including Solobacterium moorei: a case report, J. Med. Case Rep. 1 (2007) 1–3.
- [71] M. Hernandez-Blanco, J.J. Costa, A. Aguilera, M.G. Tamara, G. Abal-Morrazo, F. Otero-Castro, J. Álvaez, M.L.P. del Molino, Solobacterium moorei bacteraemia in a patient with Fournier's gangrene. ECCMID 2017: session: P095 Intestinal and intra abdominal infections Category: 2d, Abdominal/gastrointestinal, urinary tract & genital infections, 25, April 2017, p. 12 30–13:30 P2001. Available online:

 $\label{eq:https://www.google.com/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=1&ved=2ahUKEwiDoomv5cDpAhWRqHEKHVgMCSMQFjAAegQIBBAC&url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.escmid.org%2Fescmid_publications%2Fescmid_elibrary%2Fmaterial%2F%3Fmid%3D40523&$

usg=AOvVaw3vzfQdCU2tWsiQCwWLJdEJ. (Accessed 19 May 2020).

- [72] W.J. Liu, M. Xiao, J. Yi, Y. Li, T. Kudinha, Y.C. Xu, First case report of bacteremia caused by Solobacterium moorei in China, and literature review, BMC Infect. Dis. 19 (2019) e730.
- [73] F.G. Genderini, D. Martiny, F. Ponthieux, M.A. Argudín, M.G. Galdon, A. Zaarour, A. Libois, M. Gérard, N. Dauby, First case of Campylobacter rectus and Solobacterium moorei mixed bacteraemia successfully identified by MALDI TOF-MS, New Microb. New Infect. 31 (2019) e100587.
- [74] M. Gajdács, M. Ábrók, A. Lázár, G. Terhes, E. Urbán, Anaerobic blood culture positivity at a University Hospital in Hungary: a 5-year comparative retrospective study, Anaerobe 63 (2020) e102200.
- [75] A.C.M. Veloo, H. Jean-Pierre, U.S. Justesen, T. Morris, E. Urbán, I. Wybo, M. Kostrzewa, A.W. Friedrich, The ENRIA Workgroup. Validation of MALDI-TOF MS Biotyper database optimized for anaerobic bacteria: the ENRIA project, Anaerobe 54 (2018) 224–230.
- [76] D.L. Dunn, R.A. Barke, D.C. Ewald, R.L. Simmons, Effects of Escherichia coli and Bacteroides fragilis on peritoneal host defenses, Infect. Immun. 48 (1985) 287–291.
- [77] A. Stájer, B. Ibrahim, M. Gajdács, E. Urbán, Z. Baráth, Diagnosis and management of cervicofacial actinomycosis: lessons from two distinct clinical cases, Antibiotics 9 (2020) e139.
- [78] A. Stájer, B. Ibrahim, M. Gajdács, Z. Baráth, E. Urbán, Advances in the diagnostics and therapy of cervicofacial actinomycoses: a literature summary, Fogorv. Sz. 113 (2020) 96–104.
- [79] H. Takeuchi, M. Machigashira, N. Takeuchi, T. Nakamura, K. Noguchi, The association of periodontopathic bacteria levels in saliva and tongue coating with oral malodor in periodontitis patients, Oral Health Prev. Dent. 15 (2017) 285–291.
- [80] M. Tanaka, Y. Yamamoto, M. Kuboniwa, A. Nonaka, N. Nishida, K. Madea, H. Nagata, S. Shizukishi, Contribution of periodontal pathogens on tongue dorsa analyzed with real-time PCR to oral malodor, Microb. Infect. 6 (2004) 1078–1083.
- [81] N. Sterer, M. Rosenberg, Streptococcus salivarius promotes mucin putrefaction and malodor production by Porphyromonas gingivalis, J. Dent. Res. 85 (2006) 910–914.
- [82] Y. Nakano, M. Yoshimura, T. Koga, Methyl mercaptan production by periodontal bacteria, Int. Dent. J. 52 (2002) 217–220.
- [83] H. Sharma, G.Y.M. Yunus, An insight into halitosis, Int. J. Oral Health Med. Res. 2 (2015) 93–97.
- [84] Z. Fedorowicz, H. Aljufairi, M. Nasser, T.L. Outhouse, V. Pedrazzi, Mouthrinses for the treatment of halitosis, Cochrane Database Syst. Rev. 8 (4) (2008) CD006701.
- [85] R.A. Jameel, S.S. Khan, M.F. Kamaruddin, Z.H.A. Rahim, M.M. Bakri, F.B.A. Razak, Is synthetic mouthwash the final choice to treat oral malodour?, J. Coll. Physicians. Surg. Pak. 24 (2014) 757–762.
- [86] I. Brook, H.M. Wexler, E.J.C. Goldstein, Antianaerobic antimicrobials: spectrum and susceptibility testing, Clin. Microbiol. Rev. 26 (2013) 526–546.
- [87] N.S. Dar-Odeh, O.A. Abu-Hammad, M.K. Al-Omiri, A.S. Khraisat, A.A. Shehabi, Antibiotic prescribing practices by dentists: a review, Therapeut. Clin. Risk Manag. 6 (2010) 301–306.