

ACTA  
ETHNOGRAPHICA  
HUNGARICA

Volume 63 Number 2 2018

Editor-in-Chief: ÁGNES FÜLEMILE

Associate Editors: FRUZSINA CSEH, ZSUZSANNA CSELÉNYI  
Review-Editors: CSABA MÉSZÁROS, KATALIN VARGHA  
Translators: ZSUZSANNA CSELÉNYI, JÁNOS HIDEG, MICHAEL KANDÓ  
Layout Editor: RITA KOVÁCS

Guest editors: CSABA MÉSZÁROS, GÁBOR VARGYAS

Editorial Board

BALÁZS BALOGH, ELEK BARTHA, BALÁZS BORSOS, MIKLÓS CSERI, LAJOS KEMECSI,  
LÁSZLÓ KÓSA, ILDIKÓ LANDGRAF, TAMÁS MOHAY, LÁSZLÓ MÓD,  
ATTILA PALÁDI-KOVÁCS, GÁBOR VARGYAS, VILMOS VOIGT

International Advisory Board

MARTA BOTÍKOVÁ (Bratislava, Slovakia), DANIEL DRASCEK (Regensburg, Germany),  
DAGNOSLAW DEMSKI (Warsaw, Poland), INGRID SLAVEC GRADIŠNIK (Ljubljana, Slovenia),  
DMITRIY A. FUNK (Moscow, Russia), CHRIS HANN (Halle, Germany),  
KRISTA HARPER (Amherst, MA USA), ANYA PETERSON ROYCE (Bloomington, IN USA),  
FERENC POZSONY (Cluj, Romania), HELENA RUOTSALA (Turku, Finland),  
MARY N. TAYLOR (New York, NY USA), ANDRÁS ZEMPLÉNI (Paris, France)

Cover photo: Assessing fieldwork data with villagers.  
Aryktaakh, Yakutia, Russian Federation, 2013 (Photo by the camera of Csaba Mészáros)

Cover design: DÉNES KASZTA

Financial support was provided by grant number NKA 106113/00274.



AKADÉMIAI KIADÓ

# Contents

## FIELDWORK IN CONTEMPORARY HUNGARIAN ETHNOGRAPHY

Guest Editors: Csaba Mészáros and Gábor Vargyas

<i>CSABA MÉSZÁROS – GÁBOR VARGYAS</i> : Fieldwork and Ethnographic Data: Hungarian Ethnological Scholarship. Foreword	281
<i>MIHÁLY SÁRKÁNY</i> : Research Interests and Fields	285
<i>BALÁZS BALOGH</i> : “Appointment” and Spontaneous Field Situations: Ethnographic Fieldwork in the Hungarian Communities of American Industrial Towns and Mining Settlements	301
<i>GÁBOR VARGYAS</i> : Fieldwork, Politics, Ethics	323
<i>ZOLTÁN NAGY</i> : Conflict and Fieldwork	345
<i>CSABA MÉSZÁROS</i> : Vertical and Horizontal Approaches to Kinship and Ways of Doing Anthropological Fieldwork in Siberia	361
<i>ILDIKÓ TAMÁS</i> : Field, Data, Access. Fieldwork among the Sámi from the Perspective of Assimilation and Ethnic Revitalization Processes	377
<i>VILMOS KESZEG</i> : Talking Strategies and Speech Functions	395
<i>ÉVA MIKOS</i> : Paradigm Shift in the History of Folkloristic Fieldwork at the Turn of the 19 <sup>th</sup> and 20 <sup>th</sup> Centuries and in the First Half of the 20 <sup>th</sup> Century	413
<i>TÜNDE TURAI</i> : Nurses at Multiple Locations – Research on Multiple Sites Methodological Decisions, Multi-Sited Ethnography	435
<i>GABRIELLA TUBOLY-VINCZE</i> : Silence is Golden. Lessons from a Traumatized Field	455
<i>ÁGOTA LÍDIA ISPÁN – DÁNIEL BABAI – LÁSZLÓ MÓD – VIKTOR ULICSNI – CSABA MÉSZÁROS</i> : Complex Ethnographic Research Methods for the Study of Protected Areas and Border Communities at the Slovenian-Hungarian Border	471

## Reviews

- Ethno-Lore*. XXXIII. BALOGH, Balázs (editor in chief), MÉSZÁROS, Csaba – VARGYAS, Gábor (guest editors). 2016, Budapest: MTA BTK NTI. 364 (Ágnes Hesz) 501
- Ethno-Lore*. XXXIV. BALOGH, Balázs (editor in chief), MÉSZÁROS, Csaba – VARGYAS, Gábor (guest editors). 2017, Budapest: MTA BTK NTI. 358 (Tünde Turai) 503
- LAJOS, Veronika – POVEDÁK, István – RÉGI, Tamás (eds.):  
*The Anthropology of Encounters – A találkozások antropológiája*. 2017, Budapest: Magyar Kulturális Antropológiai Társaság. 252 (Csaba Mészáros) 506
- HORVÁTH PULI, Ferenc: *Farben und Formenkultur der Ungarischen Zigeuner*. [Colors and Forms in Hungarian Gipsy Culture]. 2016, Authors edition: n. p. 271 (Imre Gráfik) 508
- VOIGT, Vilmos: *Negyvenöt év a szerelem kertjében. Összegyűjtött tanulmányok*. [Forty-Five Years in the Garden of Love. Collected Studies]. 2013, Érd: Mundus Novus Könyvek. 264 (Krisztina Frauhammer) 510
- VOIGT, Vilmos: *Az európai folklór – a középkor végéig*. [European Folklore – until the end of the Middle Ages]. 2015, Budapest: Loisir. 322 (Bernadett Smid) 513
- SÁRKÖZI, Ildikó Gyöngyvér: *A mártírium homályából. Sibe ősök és hősök a kínai nemzetépítés oltárán* [From the Mists of Martyrdom. Sibe Ancestors and Heroes on the Altar of Chinese Nation-Building] (Kultúrák keresztútján 24.). 2018, Budapest – Pécs: Institute of Ethnology, Research Centre for the Humanities, HAS – Department of Ethnography and Cultural Anthropology, Faculty of Humanities, University of Pécs – L'Harmattan Publisher. 320 (Zoltán Nagy) 516

to follow his versatile work until the present day. Having become familiar with his research in connection with colors and forms in Roma culture, I consider it important for the Hungarian scientific community to know about it as soon as possible. As a result, it was based on my recommendation that Puli-Horváth's study entitled *Colors and Forms in Hungarian Gipsy Culture*, which contains 142 diagrams along with 10 black and white as well as colored samples, was published by the Hungarian Ethnographic Society in its periodical dealing with Roma studies. (See: BÓDI, Zsuzsanna (ed.) *Cigány Néprajzi Tanulmányok* 7. [Roma Ethnographic Studies 7], 33–120. Budapest: Magyar Néprajzi Társaság. 1998). It should be noted that, unfortunately, this fact is not mentioned in the book currently under review, although the study is available online: [http://www.sulinet.hu/oroksegtar/data/magyarorszag\\_i\\_nemzetisegek/romak/cigany\\_neprajzi\\_tanulmanyok\\_1998/pages/004a\\_A\\_magyarorszag\\_i.htm](http://www.sulinet.hu/oroksegtar/data/magyarorszag_i_nemzetisegek/romak/cigany_neprajzi_tanulmanyok_1998/pages/004a_A_magyarorszag_i.htm).

Given that the Puli-Horváth's work is overwhelmingly based on an analysis of extensive fieldwork and interview materials, also worthy of special attention from the perspective of ethnographic science, we may discern one small flaw, namely that the author's analysis did not include the theory and practice of general color dynamics and the results cited in professional literature (Compare: NEMCSICS, Antal: *Színdinamika – Színes környezet tervezése* [Color Dynamics – Designing Colored Environments]. Budapest: Akadémia. 2004).

The dissertation contained in the present book, published privately, with the entire text in German (including notes, footnotes, bibliography and a brief English language synopsis), will presumably be difficult to obtain. This is why we consider it important to notify readers of *Acta Ethnographica Hungarica* about its publication. In summary, the book comprises a presentation of research on Hungarian Roma culture based on a unique approach to observation and analysis, making it singular among publications in national as well as international professional literature.

---

VOIGT, Vilmos: *Negyvenöt év a szerelem kertjében. Összegyűjtött tanulmányok* [Forty-Five Years in the Garden of Love. Collected Studies]. 2013, Érd: Mundus Novus Könyvek. 264. ISBN 978-963-9713 33-8

---

*Krisztina Frauhammer*

University of Szeged, Hungarian Academy of Sciences – University of Szeged,  
Research Group for the Study of Religious Culture, Szeged

Vilmos Voigt is a highly influential figure in Hungarian folkloristics and an internationally renowned researcher. Besides his writings on folklore, he is also well-versed researcher in the fields of aesthetics, semiotics, religious studies and the philology of literature and art. However, he feels most in his element when he can create connections between these disciplines and take a comparative approach to his subject. It was in the spirit of this interdisciplinary and comparative approach that he produced his cycle of studies on the motif of the garden of love.

The title of the volume provides a brief introduction into his empirical method of assembling data as a jigsaw puzzle over a period of 45 years on a single subject within folkloristics (lovers talking in the garden at dawn) and his analysis of a motif that appears within that subject (*'poison instead of honey'*, symbolizing unfaithfulness). Voigt first gave an overview of the theme first in 1969 when the public could read three major studies published in the leading journal of Hungarian ethnology *Ethnographia* (1969, 1970, 1980). These three articles constitute the main text of the volume under review. The lengthy, three-part study was followed by an overview of the genre history and cultural history of love songs, published in 1979. These four studies were built around a single goal: using the method of folklore textology to demonstrate the period in which Hungarian strophic lyrical folk poetry arose. Here, Voigt goes against earlier opinions widely held in Hungarian folkloristics, namely that the lyric folk song was already present in our culture in the period before settlement in Hungary (896). He puts the date of its appearance much later, to 1603, when the first stand-alone text on a lyrical encounter in the garden of love appears in a manuscript collection from the Moldavian Csangos (a Hungarian-speaking ethnic group living in the Romanian province of Moldavia). This is the earliest manuscript Hungarian poem for which we also have folklore parallels dating from the 19<sup>th</sup> century. The author therefore considers that by analyzing these two layers (written and oral poetry) of lyrical motifs it is feasible to show the laws of lyric development, the process of passing down the tradition. For this he takes into consideration the historical development of literature, its social background (e.g. the appearance of minnesänger and troubadours), as well as its cultural history, and occasionally even data on the history of metre. He shows that the motifs of a highly decorative garden serving as a place for love, the *locus amoenus* and *'poison instead of honey'* have long been known in various genres and works of literature. International comparative research has confirmed this with many parallels. Among these parallels, the author cites an entire series of examples from China, Japan, Mesopotamia, Ancient Greece, the Old Testament, India, Arabia, Persia and the Koran. In addition, he cites a wealth of comparable data from medieval European literature (French, English, German, Italian, Scandinavian). The volume includes 79 illustrations complementing the literary texts. These include works of art portraying the Garden of Paradise, the months (the garden of love is linked mainly to the month of May), and splendid gardens. There are also images portraying folk life and depictions of what are regarded as folk objects (honey cake molds, woodprints, glass paintings etc.), giving an indication of how widespread this motif is. The author emphasizes that these data also demonstrate how little there is to support and how unrealistic the prehistoric, ethnic preconception that so often crops up in Hungarian folkloristics in connection with love poetry is. He brings the same thorough approach to an examination of the *locus amoenus* theme that appears in world folklore. Finally, he places the Hungarian literary data within this broader context. His textual analysis leads him to the conclusion that the love poetry appearing in Hungarian sources probably draws on international sources and is inseparable from Renaissance literature.

The next piece in the volume is innovative in its methodology. The author places visual images beside textual sources and attempts to show the meaning of the different works of art, outlining the cultural and historical background of the motif to reveal the unity of images and texts. One of the most exciting parts of this cycle of studies is when

the folklorist interprets the motifs already described via two paintings by Jan Massys (1510–1575), an artist of the Antwerp school. Both paintings portray Flora, the Roman goddess of flowers and spring. Vilmos Voigt analyses a dozen similarities and differences between the two versions of Flora. He then shows that the two Floras seated in the garden of love represent the two faces of Venus (*amor divinus, amor humanus*). They represent *humanitas*, a refined, artistically and philosophically reinterpreted portrayal of the universe.

The two last pieces in the volume were also written in the spirit of the author's iconographic, comparative approach to the Massys analysis (first published: 2003, 2010). In these Vilmos Voigt presents more visual images of love and the flowers in the garden of love. The first is an exciting analysis of the Angelo Bronzino (1503–1572) painting *Venus, Cupid and Jealousy* (Budapest, Museum of Fine Arts), and its portrayal of jealousy. The final study presents the flowers in the garden of love, examining both visual and textual portrayals. Voigt's complex methodology is apparent here as well, wherein he places the data of the visual and written sources in the history of Hungarian and European gardens with the confidence of a garden historian.

The studies are followed by a 25-page postscript, in which Voigt meditates on the response in Hungary to his theoretical findings on the theme. In addition, the author points to the need for further research drawing on literature and data from comparative social and cultural history. The volume ends with an English summary and indexes facilitating use of the volume.

Through the complex examination of a single motif (drawing on textual philology, iconography, social and cultural history), Vilmos Voigt aims to provide an example of how he sees comparative folkloristics embedded in a social/historical approach. It will be no easy task to follow his methodology. Thanks to his knowledge of many languages and his extensive reading, Vilmos Voigt is equally comfortable dealing with folklore, literature, the fine arts and corresponding literature, from China to the Balkans, from ancient times to the present. Indeed, if the topic requires, he enjoys venturing into other areas of cultural history, for example into garden history in the present case. As we read his iconographic analyses, in our mind's eye we can imagine him in the art galleries of Europe, carefully studying minute details and storing them in his memory for later use with texts. He brings the same close and all-encompassing attention to his analysis and comparison of texts. We can only regret that the same attention to detail has not been given to the editing of the text in this volume. Footnotes and references are not included for all of the republished studies; the reader is referred to the original place of publication. This can be inconvenient, in the same way as multiple repetition in parts of the content.

Despite these shortcomings, I can warmly recommend this cycle of studies for readers interested in curiosities of both folklore and cultural history. Vilmos Voigt has compiled a unique collection of data on the garden of love motif and has made exemplary use of it in support of his theoretical ideas.